

Message Text

PAGE 01 STATE 244382 TOSEC 150013

70

ORIGIN NODS-00

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 /001 R

DRAFTED BY S:LSEAGLEBURGER:BL
APPROVED BY S - MR. EAGLEBURGER
S/S-O: MTANNER
DESIRED DISTRIBUTION
S, LSE, NSC-SCOWCROFT ONLY
----- 104431
O 150042Z OCT 75 ZFF4
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO USDEL SECRETARY IMMEDIATE

S E C R E T STATE 244382 TOSEC 150013

NODIS

E.O. 11652: GDS

TAGS: OVIP (KISSINGER, HENRY A.)
SUBJECT: LETTER TO PIKE COMMITTEE

FOR THE SECRETARY FROM EAGLEBURGER

1. HERE IS THE FINAL TEXT OF THE LETTER TO PIKE. IT WILL BE DELIVERED WEDNESDAY AT NOON AS WE HAVE AGREED.
2. BEGIN TEXT: DEAR MR. CHAIRMAN: I HAVE GIVEN MUCH THOUGHT TO THE SELECT COMMITTEE'S OCTOBER 2 REQUEST THAT I PROVIDE IT WITH A COPY OF A DISSENT MEMORANDUM, ON THE CYPRUS CRISIS, SENT ME BY A FOREIGN SERVICE OFFICER IN AUGUST 1974. AFTER CAREFUL CONSIDERATION I HAVE DECIDED THAT I CANNOT COMPLY WITH THAT REQUEST. I RESPECTFULLY REQUEST THE COMMITTEE TO WORK WITH ME ON ALTERNATE METHODS OF PUTTING BEFORE IT THE INFORMATION RELEVANT TO ITS INQUIRY.
3. THE "DISSENT CHANNEL," THROUGH WHICH THIS MEMORANDUM WAS SUBMITTED, PROVIDES THOSE OFFICERS OF THE DEPARTMENT
SECRET

PAGE 02 STATE 244382 TOSEC 150013

OF STATE WHO DISAGREE WITH ESTABLISHED POLICY, OR WHO HAVE NEW POLICIES TO RECOMMEND, A MEANS FOR COMMUNICATING THEIR VIEWS TO THE HIGHEST LEVELS OF THE DEPARTMENT. "DISSENT CHANNEL" MESSAGES AND MEMORANDA ARE FORWARDED TO THE SECRETARY OF STATE, AND ARE NORMALLY GIVEN RESTRICTED DISTRIBUTION.

TION WITHIN THE DEPARTMENT. THEY CANNOT BE STOPPED BY ANY INTERMEDIATE OFFICE.

4. MR. CHAIRMAN, I TAKE THE POSITION I HAVE RELUCTANTLY, AND ONLY BECAUSE I HAVE CONCLUDED THAT THE CIRCUMSTANCES ARE COMPELLING. I AM CONVINCED THAT I WOULD BE REMISS IN MY DUTY AS SECRETARY OF STATE WERE I TO FOLLOW A DIFFERENT COURSE.

5. THE CHALLENGES THAT FACE OUR NATION IN THE FIELD OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS HAVE NEVER BEEN MORE DIFFICULT; THE PACE OF EVENTS HAS NEVER BEEN SO RAPID; THE REVOLUTIONARY CHARACTER OF THE CHANGES TAKING PLACE AROUND US HAS SELDOM BEEN MORE PRONOUNCED. IF WE ARE TO PROSPER -- INDEED, IF WE ARE TO SURVIVE -- IT WILL REQUIRE THE CONFIDENCE OF THE AMERICAN PEOPLE AND OF THE NATIONS OF THE WORLD IN THE WISDOM OF OUR FOREIGN POLICY AND THE EFFECTIVENESS OF OUR FOREIGN POLICY ESTABLISHMENT. BASIC TO THIS SENSE OF CONFIDENCE, OF COURSE, IS THE QUALITY AND PROFESSIONALISM OF THE DEPARTMENT OF STATE AND THE FOREIGN SERVICE. AND THE STRENGTH OF THOSE INSTITUTIONS DEPENDS, TO A CRITICAL DEGREE, UPON THE JUDGMENT AND STRENGTH OF PURPOSE OF THE MEN AND WOMEN WHO SERVE IN THEM. IT IS MY VIEW THAT TO TURN OVER THE DISSENT MEMORANDUM AS REQUESTED WOULD INEVITABLY BE DESTRUCTIVE OF THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS OF THE DEPARTMENT, AND HENCE DO GREAT DAMAGE TO THE CONDUCT OF OUR FOREIGN RELATIONS AND THE NATIONAL SECURITY OF THE UNITED STATES.

6. SINCE THE FOUNDING OF THE REPUBLIC, EVERY SECRETARY OF STATE HAS BEEN REGARDED AS THE PRINCIPAL ADVISER OF THE PRESIDENT IN THE FORMULATION OF FOREIGN POLICY AND IN THE CONDUCT OF FOREIGN RELATIONS. IF THE SECRETARY OF STATE IS TO DISCHARGE HIS OBLIGATIONS AND DUTIES TO THE PRESIDENT AND THE NATIONAL INTEREST, HE MUST HAVE THE BENEFIT OF THE BEST AVAILABLE ADVICE AND CRITICISM FROM HIS SUBORDINATES;
SECRET

PAGE 03 STATE 244382 TOSEC 150013

THEY IN TURN, IF THEY ARE TO GIVE THEIR BEST, MUST ENJOY A GUARANTEE THAT SUCH ADVICE OR CRITICISM, CANDIDLY GIVEN, WILL REMAIN PRIVILEGED.

7. AS THE SUPREME COURT HAS SAID: "THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS CONFIDENTIALITY IS TOO PLAIN TO REQUIRE FURTHER DISCUSSION. HUMAN EXPERIENCE TEACHES THAT THOSE WHO EXPECT PUBLIC DISSEMINATION OF THEIR REMARKS MAY WELL TEMPER CANDOR WITH A CONCERN FOR APPEARANCES AND FOR THEIR OWN INTERESTS TO THE DETRIMENT OF THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS."

8. AS THE CYPRUS CRISIS EVOLVED, I RECEIVED MANY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR VARIOUS COURSES OF ACTION FROM MY

SUBORDINATES. THEIR VIEWS WERE FREELY OFFERED AND FULLY CONSIDERED IN THE POLICY-MAKING PROCESS. BUT THE FINAL CHOICES OF WHAT POLICIES TO RECOMMEND TO THE PRESIDENT WERE MINE, AND THEY SOMETIMES DIFFERED FROM THE COURSES OF ACTION PROPOSED TO ME BY SOME OF MY ASSOCIATES. MY DECISIONS OCCASIONALLY LED TO VIGOROUS DISSENT, BOTH DURING MEETINGS WITH THOSE OF MY COLLEAGUES WHO DISAGREED, AND IN WRITTEN MEMORANDA, AS IN THE CASE PRESENTLY BEFORE US. SHOULD THE SELECT COMMITTEE SO DESIRE, I AM PREPARED PERSONALLY TO COME BEFORE THE COMMITTEE TO DESCRIBE IN DETAIL THE DISSENTING VIEWS PUT TO ME, AND MY REASONS FOR REJECTING THEM.

9. BUT WERE I TO AGREE TO RELEASE THE DOCUMENT REQUESTED, EVEN ON A CLASSIFIED BASIS, I WOULD BE PARTY TO THE DESTRUCTION OF THE PRIVACY OF COMMUNICATION WHICH THE SECRETARY OF STATE MUST HAVE WITH HIS

SUBORDINATES REGARDING THEIR OPINIONS. ONCE THE CONFIDENTIALITY OF INTERNAL COMMUNICATIONS HAD BEEN BREACHED, IT WOULD BE BUT A SHORT STEP TO PUBLIC EXPLOITATION OF THE SUBORDINATE'S VIEWS. THE RESULT WOULD BE TO PLACE DEPARTMENT OFFICERS IN AN INTOLERABLE POSITION -- AT TIMES PRAISED, AT TIMES CRITICIZED FOR THEIR VIEWS; AT TIMES PRAISED, AT TIMES CRITICIZED FOR
SECRET

PAGE 04 STATE 244382 TOSEC 150013

DISSENTING; AT TIMES PRAISED, AT TIMES CRITICIZED FOR NOT DISSENTING.

10. THUS, MY DECISION TO WITHHOLD THE DOCUMENT IS NOT BASED ON A DESIRE TO KEEP ANYTHING FROM THE SELECT COMMITTEE WITH REGARD TO THE CYPRUS CRISIS OR ANY OTHER SUBJECT. ON THE CONTRARY, THE DEPARTMENT AND I ARE BOTH PREPARED TO COOPERATE WITH THE COMMITTEE IN THE PURSUIT OF ITS LEGISLATIVELY ESTABLISHED PURPOSES. THE ISSUE IS NOT WHAT INFORMATION THE COMMITTEE SHOULD RECEIVE; WE AGREE ON THAT QUESTION. RATHER, THE ISSUE IS FROM WHOM THE INFORMATION SHOULD BE SOUGHT, AND THE FORM IN WHICH IT SHOULD BE DELIVERED.

11. IT IS MY STRONG BELIEF THAT THE COMMITTEE SHOULD LOOK TO THE POLICY LEVELS OF THE DEPARTMENT, AND NOT TO JUNIOR AND MIDDLE-LEVEL OFFICERS, FOR THE POLICY INFORMATION THEY SEEK. IT IS MY PRINCIPAL ADVISERS AND I WHO ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR POLICY, AND IT IS WE WHO SHOULD BE HELD ACCOUNTABLE BEFORE THE CONGRESS AND THE AMERICAN PEOPLE FOR THE MANNER IN WHICH WE EXERCISE THE AUTHORITY AND RESPONSIBILITY VESTED IN US BY THE PRESIDENT AND CONGRESS OF THE UNITED STATES.

12. IN KEEPING WITH THIS PRINCIPLE I AM PREPARED NOW,
AS I HAVE BEEN FROM THE BEGINNING, TO DO THE FOLLOWING:

--AUTHORIZE ANY OFFICER OF THE DEPARTMENT OR THE FOREIGN
SERVICE, REGARDLESS OF RANK, TO TESTIFY BEFORE THE
SELECT COMMITTEE ON ALL FACTS KNOWN BY THAT OFFICER ABOUT
THE COLLECTION AND USE OF INTELLIGENCE INFORMATION IN
FOREIGN RELATIONS CRISES.

--AUTHORIZE ANY POLICY LEVEL OFFICER OF THE DEPARTMENT
OR THE FOREIGN SERVICE TO TESTIFY BEFORE THE SELECT
COMMITTEE ON RECOMMENDATIONS RECEIVED BY HIM FROM HIS
SUBORDINATES, BUT WITHOUT IDENTIFICATION OF AUTHORSHIP,
AND ANY RECOMMENDATIONS HE FORWARDED TO HIS SUPERIORS.

--SUPPLY THE COMMITTEE WITH A SUMMARY FROM ALL SOURCES,
BUT WITHOUT IDENTIFICATION OF AUTHORSHIP, OF VIEWS AND
SECRET

PAGE 05 STATE 244382 TOSEC 150013

RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE CYPRUS CRISIS, AND CRITICISMS
OF OUR HANDLING OF IT.

--APPEAR PERSONALLY BEFORE THE COMMITTEE TO TESTIFY AS TO
THE POLICY OF THE UNITED STATES WITH REGARD TO THE
CYPRUS CRISIS, AS WELL AS THE POLICY OF THIS DEPARTMENT
WITH REGARD TO THE ACCOUNTABILITY OF JUNIOR AND MIDDLE-
LEVEL OFFICERS FOR THEIR VIEWS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.

13. THE ISSUE RAISED BY THE REQUEST FOR THE DISSENT
MEMORANDUM RUNS TO THE FUNDAMENTAL QUESTION OF WHETHER
THE SECRETARY OF STATE SHOULD BE ASKED TO DISCLOSE THE
ADVICE, RECOMMENDATIONS, OR DISSENTS TO POLICY THAT
COME TO HIM FROM SUBORDINATE OFFICERS.

14. THAT THE NATION MUST HAVE THE MOST COMPETENT AND
PROFESSIONAL FOREIGN SERVICE POSSIBLE IS SURELY BEYOND
QUESTION. IT MUST BE THE REPOSITORY FOR THE LESSONS
LEARNED OVER MORE THAN THREE DECADES OF WORLD INVOLVE-
MENT; THE INSTITUTION TO WHICH EACH NEW ADMINISTRATION
LOOKS FOR THE WISDOM GARNERED FROM THE PAST AND THE
INITIATIVES SO NECESSARY TO COPE WITH THE FUTURE. IT
MUST BE LOYAL TO THE PRESIDENT, NO MATTER WHAT HIS
POLITICAL PERSUASION; IT MUST INSPIRE CONFIDENCE IN
ITS JUDGMENT FROM THE CONGRESS, NO MATTER WHAT PARTY IS
IN POWER THERE. THE FOREIGN SERVICE, IN A WORD, SHOULD
BE AMERICA'S GUARANTEE OF CONTINUITY IN THE CONDUCT OF
OUR FOREIGN AFFAIRS.

15. WE NOW HAVE AN OUTSTANDING, DISCIPLINED, AND
DEDICATED FOREIGN SERVICE -- PERHAPS THE BEST IN THE
WORLD. IT IS THE CONTINUED STRENGTH AND UTILITY OF THIS
INSTITUTION THAT WILL BE UNDERMINED BY REVEALING THE

OPINIONS AND JUDGMENTS OF JUNIOR AND MIDDLE-LEVEL OFFICERS.

16. WHILE I KNOW THAT THE SELECT COMMITTEE HAS NO INTENTION OF EMBARRASSING OR EXPLOITING JUNIOR AND MIDDLE-GRADE OFFICERS OF THE DEPARTMENT, THERE HAVE BEEN OTHER TIMES AND OTHER COMMITTEES -- AND THERE MAY BE AGAIN -- WHERE POSITIONS TAKEN BY FOREIGN SERVICE
SECRET

PAGE 06 STATE 244382 TOSEC 150013

OFFICERS WERE EXPOSED TO EX POST FACTO PUBLIC EXAMINATION AND RECRIMINATION. THE RESULTS ARE TOO WELL KNOWN TO NEED ELABORATION HERE: GROSS INJUSTICE TO LOYAL PUBLIC SERVANTS, A SAPPING OF THE MORALE AND ABILITIES OF THE FOREIGN SERVICE; AND SERIOUS DAMAGE TO THE ABILITY OF THE DEPARTMENT AND THE PRESIDENT TO FORMULATE AND CONDUCT THE FOREIGN AFFAIRS OF THE NATION. MR. CHAIRMAN, I CANNOT, IN GOOD CONSCIENCE, BY MY OWN FAILURE TO RAISE THE ISSUE OF PRINCIPLE, BE RESPONSIBLE FOR CONTRIBUTING TO A SITUATION IN WHICH SIMILAR EXCESSES COULD OCCUR AGAIN.

17. THE CONSIDERATIONS I HAVE OUTLINED RELATE TO THE BROAD QUESTION OF TESTIMONY FROM, AND DOCUMENTS AUTHORED BY JUNIOR AND MIDDLE-LEVEL OFFICERS. THE REQUEST FOR A SPECIFIC DISSENT MEMORANDUM RAISES A PARTICULAR ISSUE WITHIN THAT BROADER FRAMEWORK. THE "DISSENT CHANNEL," ESTABLISHED BY MY PREDECESSOR, HAD ITS ORIGIN IN THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF SPECIAL TASK FORCES MADE UP OF CAREER PROFESSIONALS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF STATE, THE FOREIGN SERVICE AND OTHER FOREIGN AFFAIRS AGENCIES. TWO OF THESE TASK FORCES RECOMMENDED THAT IMPROVED MEANS BE FOUND TO TRANSMIT NEW IDEAS TO THE DEPARTMENT'S DECISION-MAKERS, TO SUBJECT POLICY TO THE CHALLENGE OF AN ADVERSARY REVIEW, AND TO ENCOURAGE THE EXPRESSION OF DISSENTING VIEWS.

18. THE VERY PURPOSES OF THE "DISSENT CHANNEL" -- TO PROMOTE AN ATMOSPHERE OF OPENNESS IN THE FORMULATION OF FOREIGN POLICY, TO STIMULATE FRESH, CREATIVE IDEAS, AND TO ENCOURAGE A QUESTIONING OF ESTABLISHED POLICIES - - ARE INCONSISTENT WITH DISCLOSURE OF SUCH REPORTS TO AN INVESTIGATIVE COMMITTEE OF THE CONGRESS, AND PERHAPS ULTIMATELY TO THE PUBLIC. DISSENT MEMORANDA ARE, BY THEIR VERY NATURE, STATEMENTS OF THE AUTHOR'S OPINIONS. IF THEIR CONFIDENTIALITY CANNOT BE ASSURED,

IF THEY ARE TO BE HELD UP TO SUBSEQUENT CONGRESSIONAL OR PUBLIC AUTOPSY, THE WHOLE PURPOSE OF THE "DISSENT
SECRET

PAGE 07 STATE 244382 TOSEC 150013

CHANNEL" WILL HAVE BEEN CORRUPTED AND THE CHANNEL ITSELF WILL SOON CEASE TO BE A VIABLE INSTRUMENT. THOSE WHOSE LEGITIMATE PURPOSE IS TO ARGUE WITH A POLICY BECAUSE THEY SINCERELY BELIEVE IT TO BE ILL-CONCEIVED, OR BECAUSE THEY HAVE NEW BUT UNORTHODOX IDEAS, WILL RECOGNIZE THE CHANNEL FOR WHAT IT HAS BECOME AND CEASE TO USE IT; THOSE WHO CARE LITTLE ABOUT WHAT THE POLICY IS, AND EVEN LESS ABOUT SEEKING TO CHANGE THAT POLICY THROUGH THE INSTITUTIONAL PROCESSES OPEN TO THEM, WILL BE ENCOURAGED TO USE THE CHANNEL AS A TOOL FOR THEIR OWN ENDS.

19. FOR THESE REASONS, MR. CHAIRMAN, I CANNOT AGREE TO THE RELEASE OF "DISSENT CHANNEL" MESSAGES -- IRRESPECTIVE OF THEIR CONTENTS. I AM, HOWEVER, READY TO SUPPLY A SUMMARY OF ALL CONTRARY ADVICE I RECEIVED ON THE CYPRUS CRISIS, SO LONG AS IT IS NOT NECESSARY TO DISCLOSE THE SOURCE OF THIS ADVICE.

20. EVERY SECRETARY OF STATE HAS AN OBLIGATION TO HIS COUNTRY AND TO HIS SUCCESSOR TO BUILD A PROFESSIONAL, EFFECTIVE, DEDICATED, AND DISCIPLINED FOREIGN SERVICE. WERE I TO COMPLY WITH THE REQUEST BEFORE ME I WOULD HAVE FAILED IN THAT OBLIGATION. I WOULD HAVE BEEN PARTLY RESPONSIBLE FOR A PROCESS THAT WOULD ALMOST INEVITABLY HAVE POLITICIZED THE FOREIGN SERVICE, DISCOURAGED COURAGEOUS ADVICE AND THE FREE EXPRESSION OF DISSENTING OPINION, AND ENCOURAGED TIMIDITY AND CAUTION.

21. ON ANOTHER OCCASION WHEN THE STATE DEPARTMENT WAS UNDER INVESTIGATION MY GREAT PREDECESSOR, DEAN ACHESON, WROTE THAT THERE IS A RIGHT WAY AND A WRONG WAY TO DEAL WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF STATE. "THE RIGHT WAY," HE SAID, "MET THE EVIL AND PRESERVED THE INSTITUTION; THE WRONG WAY DID NOT MEET THE EVIL AND DESTROYED THE INSTITUTION. MORE THAN THAT, IT DESTROYED THE FAITH OF THE COUNTRY IN ITS GOVERNMENT, AND OF OUR ALLIES IN US."

22. I AM PREPARED TO WORK WITH THE HOUSE SELECT COM-
SECRET

PAGE 08 STATE 244382 TOSEC 150013

MITTEE ON INTELLIGENCE IN A COOPERATIVE SPIRIT SO THAT, FOR THE SAKE OF OUR COUNTRY, WE MAY JOINTLY, ON THE BASIS OF THE PROPOSALS CONTAINED IN THIS LETTER, FIND THE "RIGHT" WAY TO ACCOMMODATE OUR MUTUAL CONCERNS. I

AM PREPARED TO MEET WITH THE COMMITTEE AT ITS CONVENIENCE TO SEARCH FOR A REASONABLE SOLUTION -- A SOLUTION WHICH WILL MEET THE NEEDS OF THE COMMITTEE,

PROTECT THE INTEGRITY OF THE DEPARTMENT OF STATE, AND
PROMOTE THE EFFECTIVE CONDUCT OF THE FOREIGN RELATIONS
OF THE UNITED STATES. SINCERELY, HENRY A. KISSINGER.
END TEXT. INGERSOLL

SECRET

<< END OF DOCUMENT >>

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: Z
Capture Date: 26 AUG 1999
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: TOSEC, TEXT, POLICIES, DIPLOMATIC COMMUNICATIONS, US CONGRESSIONAL HEARINGS, DIPLOMATIC PERSONNEL, CLASSIFIED INFORMATION, CAT-A
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 15 OCT 1975
Decaption Date: 28 MAY 2004
Decaption Note: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Authority: GolinoFR
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 28 MAY 2004
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1975STATE244382
Document Source: ADS
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: S:LSEAGLEBURGER:BL
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: 11652 GDS
Errors: n/a
Film Number: P850033-2127
From: STATE
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1975/newtext/t197510102/baaaacvs.tel
Line Count: 331
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, TEXT ON MICROFILM
Office: ORIGIN NODS
Original Classification: SECRET
Original Handling Restrictions: ONLY NODIS
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 7
Previous Channel Indicators:
Previous Classification: SECRET
Previous Handling Restrictions: ONLY NODIS
Reference: n/a
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Authority: GolinoFR
Review Comment: n/a
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 16 SEP 2003
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review History: RELEASED <16 SEP 2003 by KelleyW0>; APPROVED <29 OCT 2003 by GolinoFR>
Review Markings:

Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
06 JUL 2006

Review Media Identifier:
Review Referrals: n/a
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
Secure: LOCK1
Status: NATIVE
Subject: n/a
TAGS: OVIP, PINS, US, CY, (PIKE, OTIS G), (KISSINGER, HENRY A)
To: SECRETARY
Type: TE
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 06 JUL 2006